## Value of

## Investment: Mobilisation and Structure of Deal



Publish WhatYouFund
The Global Campaign for Aid Transparency

Findings from work stream 4 of the
DFI Transparency Initiative

## Contents

1. Introduction
2. Methodology
3. Findings
4. What does the research tell us?
5. Next steps
6. Q\&A

## 1. Introduction



Publish WhatYouFund
The Global Campaign for Aid Transparency

## DFI Transparency Initiative

$21 / 2$ year project looking at the use of public money by Development Finance Institutions (DFIs) to meet global development goals.

Our objective is to work collaboratively with DFIs and other stakeholders to increase the transparency of DFIs.

Our approach is evidenced-based and multi-stakeholder in two main phases; research and advocacy.

## Notes:

Research does not include FI investments at this stage.

Anonymisation of results is purposeful and intended to highlight the opportunity for sector reform, rather than institutional reform.

## Timeline



## Work streams

1. Basic Project Information
2. Impact Management - Objectives, Theories of Change and Impacts
3. Environmental, Social and Governance (ESG) and Accountability to Communities
4. Value of Investment: Mobilisation and Structure of Deal
5. Financial Intermediaries, Offshore Financial Centres and Beneficial Ownership

## Expert Working Group

- Adrian Torres (ADB)
- Chris Clubb (Convergence)
- Karin Finkelston (IFC)
- Nadia Daar (Oxfam US)
- Nadia Nikolova (Allianz)
- Paddy Carter (CDC Group)
- Petya Kangalova (IATI Secretariat)
- Rodrigo Salvado (Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation)
- Sam Attridge (ODI)
- Thomas Venon (Eighteen East Capital)


## The case for increased DFI financial transparency

This work stream assesses the transparency of the way that DFIs structure the financial aspects of their direct investments.

DFIs are an important component in scaling up investment in developing countries to achieve the SDGs principally through the mobilisation of private finance.

Timely, systematic, and standardised disclosure of financial information would allow DFIs to have a powerful demonstration effect in the markets they work in.

It also allows private investors to understand market conditions and opportunities for investment.

## 2. Methodology

## Approach

The working paper was informed by:

- a landscape analysis

| Instrument | Debt | Equity | Guarantee | Mixed <br> Instruments | Other | Undisclosed <br> Instruments | Total |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| No. of <br> projects | 66 | 46 | 13 | 8 | 6 | 33 | 172 |

- interviews with DFI employees, CSOs, private sector stakeholders and other experts
- two meetings of the Expert Working Group to discuss the landscape analysis and draft paper


## Research questions:

1. What activity level information do DFIs disclose about investment financing?
2. What aggregate information do DFIs disclose about investment financing?

## DFIs

| Bilateral DFIs <br> (non-sovereign) | Bilateral DFIs <br> (non-sovereign and <br> sovereign) | Multilateral DFIs <br> (non-sovereign) | Multilateral DFIs <br> (sovereign and non-sovereign) |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| CDC Croup (UK) | DBSA (South Africa) | International Finance <br> Corporation (IFC) | African Development Bank (AfDB) |
| DEG (Germany) |  | IDB Invest | Asian Development Bank (AsDB) |
| DFC (USA) |  | Islamic Cooperation for the <br> Development of the Private <br> Sector (ICD) | Asian Infrastructure Investment Bank (AlIB) |
| FMO (Netherlands) |  |  | Development Bank of Latin America (CAF) |
| Norfund (Norway) |  |  | European Bank for Reconstruction and <br> Development (EBRD) |
| Proparco (France) |  |  | European Investment Bank (EIB) |
| Swedfund (Sweden) |  |  |  |

## What we looked for

We used broad definitions: reflecting current lack of standardisation.

Co-Financing: third party investors in the same deal.

Concessionality: investments made at below-market rates. Concessional finance represents a subsidy to the private sector client.

Mobilisation: the stimulation of additional financing as a result of a DFI investment.

## 3. Findings

## Activity level

|  | Activity - General |  |  |  |  | Co-Financing |  |  | Concessionality |  | Mobilisation |  |  | Equity <br> $\frac{0}{2}$ $\frac{0}{n}$ $\frac{2}{3}$ $\frac{3}{4}$ | Debt |  |  | Guarantee/ Insurance |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Institution | $\begin{aligned} & \text { 菏 } \\ & \frac{8}{0} \\ & \stackrel{0}{0} \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & c \\ & \frac{0}{4} \\ & 0 \\ & 0 \\ & 0 \\ & 0 \\ & 0 \\ & \frac{0}{1} \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | $\begin{aligned} & \text { \& } \\ & \frac{0}{2} \\ & \frac{0}{W} \\ & \text { i } \end{aligned}$ |
| Bilaterals |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| DFI-1 | Partial | Yes | No | Partial | Yes | Partial | Partial | Pártial | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | N/A | N/A |
| DFI-2 | Partial | Yes | Partial | Partia | Yes | Partial | Partial | Partial | No | No | No | Partial | Partial | No | No | Partial | No | No | No |
| DFI-3 | Partial | Yes | Partial | Partial | Yes | Partial | Partial | Partial | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No |
| DFI-4 | Partial | Yes | Yes | No | Yes | Partial | Partial | Partial | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No |
| DFI-5 | No | Yes | Yes | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | N/A | N/A |
| DFI-6 | Partial | Partial | Yes | No | Partial | Partial | Partial | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | N/A | N/A |
| DFI-7 | Yes | Yes | Yes | No | Yes | Partial | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | Partial | No | Partial | No |
| DFI-8 | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No |
| Multilaterals - Private |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| DFI-18 | Partial | Yes | Yes | No | Yes | Partial | Partial | Partial | Partial | Partial | Partial | No | Partial | No | No | No | No | No | No |
| DFI-10 | Partial | Yes | Partial | Partial | Partial | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | Partial | No | No | No |
| DFI-11 | Partial | Yes | Yes | No | Yes | Partial | Partial | Partial | No | No | Partial | Partial | Partial | No | No | No | No | No | No |
| DFI-12 | Partial | Yes | Yes | No | Yes | Partial | Partial | Partial | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | N/A | N/A |
| DFI-19 | Partial | Partial | Yes | No | Yes | Partial | Partial | Partial | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | Partial | No | No | No |
| DFI-14 | Partial | Partial | Yes | No | Partial | Partial | Partial | Partial | Partial | Partial | No | No | No | Partial | No | Partial | No | No | No |
| DFI-15 | No | Yes | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No |
| DFI-20 | No | Yes | Yes | No | Yes | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | N/A | N/A |
| DFI-17 | Partial | Yes | No | No | Yes | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No |

## Aggregate level (1)

|  | Portfolio |  |  |  |  |  | Financial performance |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Institution | $\begin{aligned} & \text { y } \\ & 0 \\ & 0 \\ & 0 \\ & \frac{0}{0} \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ |  |  | $\begin{aligned} & \text { ते } \\ & \text { ㄹ } \\ & \text { o } \\ & \text { ㄴ } \\ & 0 \\ & 0 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | $\begin{aligned} & \text { n } \\ & \frac{0}{0} \\ & \text { ᄃ } \\ & \text { § } \\ & \frac{5}{0} \\ & \underset{\sim}{\circ} \end{aligned}$ |  |  |
| Bilaterals |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| DFI-1 | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | No | No | Yes | No | Yes |
| DFI-2 | Yes | Yes | Yes | No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | No | No | No | No | No | No |
| DFI-3 | Yes | Yes | Yes | No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | No | No | Yes | No | No | No |
| DFI-4 | Yes | Yes | Yes | No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | No | No | No | No | No | No |
| DFI-5 | Yes | Yes | Yes | No | Ves | Yes | Ves | Ves | No | No | Yes | No | Yes | No |
| DFI-6 | Yes | Yes | Yes | No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | No | No | No | No | No | No |
| DFI-7 | Yes | No | Yes | No | No | No | No | Yes | No | No | No | No | No | No |
| DFI-8 | Ves | No | No | No | No | No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | No | No | No |
| Multilaterals - Private |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| DFI-18 | Yes | Yes | Yes | Partial | Yes | No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | No | Yes | No |
| DFI-10 | Yes | Yas | Dartial | No | Dartial | Partial | No | Yes | No | No | Dartial | No | Yes | No |
| DFI-17 | Yes | Yes | No | No | No | No | Yes | Yes | Yes | No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| DFI-12 | Yes | Yes | No | No | No | No | Yes | Yes | No | No | No | No | No | No |
| DFI-19 | Yes | Yes | No | No | No | No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | No | Yes | Yes |
| DFI-14 | Yes | Yes | No | No | No | No | Yes | Yes | No | Yes | No | No | No | No |
| DFI-15 | Yes | Yes | No | Yes | No | No | Yes | Yes | No | No | No | Yes | No | No |
| DFI-20 | Yes | Yes | No | No | No | No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | No | No | No | No |
| DFI-17 | Yes | Yes | No | No | No | No | No | Yes | No | No | No | No | No | No |

## Aggregate level (2)

|  | Approvals/Commitments |  |  |  |  | Disbursements |  |  |  |  | Mobilisation |  |  |  |  |  | Credit Risk |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Institution | 응 능 0 |  |  | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Z } \\ & \text { ᄃ } \\ & 0 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ |  | 응 $\frac{\pi}{0}$ 0 | ". U U | $\begin{aligned} & \stackrel{\circ}{\sigma} \\ & \frac{0}{\boxed{O}} \\ & \underset{\sim}{2} \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \lambda \\ & 0 \\ & 0 \\ & 0 \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \stackrel{\rightharpoonup}{む} \\ & \text { E } \\ & \text { L } \\ & \text { Un } \\ & \underline{E} \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { 응 } \\ & \text { "̀ } \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \stackrel{\rightharpoonup}{U} \\ & \stackrel{U}{0} \end{aligned}$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Bilaterals |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| DFI-1 | Partial | Partial | Partial | No | Partial | No | No | No | No | No | Yes | No | No | No | No | Yes | No | No | No | No |
| DFI-2 | Yes | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| DFI-3 | Yes | No | Yes | Yes | Yes | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No |
| DFI-4 | Yes | Yes | Yes | No | Yes | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | Yes | No | Yes | Yes | No |
| DFI-5 | Yes | No | No | No | No | Yes | No | Yes | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | Yes | No | No | No | No |
| DFI-6 | Yes | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | Yes | No | No | Yes | No |
| DFI-7 | Yes | No | Yes | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | Yes | No | Yes | No | No | Yes | No | No | No | No |
| DFI-8 | Yes | Yes | Yes | No | Yes | Yes | Yes | No | No | Yes | Yes | No | No | No | No | No | No | Yes | Yes | Partial |
| Multilaterals - Private |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| DFI-18 | Yes | Yes | Yes | No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | No | Yes | Yes | Partial | Yes | No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | No |
| DFI-10 | Yes | Partial | Partial | Partial | Yes | Partial | No | No | Partial | No | Yes | Partial | Yes | No | No | Yes | No | No | Yes | Yes |
| DFI-17 | Yes | No | No | No | No | Yes | No | No | No | Yes | Yes | Partial | Yes | No | No | Yes | No | Yes | Yes | Yes |
| DFI-12 | Yes | No | No | No | No | Yes | No | No | No | No | Yes | Partial | Yes | No | No | N/A | No | No | Yes | No |
| DFI-19 | Yes | No | No | No | Yes | Yes | No | No | No | Yes | Yes | Partial | Yes | No | No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Partial |
| DFI-14 | Yes | No | Yes | Yes | No | Yes | No | No | No | No | Yes | Partial | Yes | No | No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Partial |
| DFI-15 | Yes | No | No | Yes | Yes | Yes | No | Yes | No | No | Yes | No | No | No | No | Yes | No | No | No | No |
| DFl-20 | Yes | Partial | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | No | No | No | No | Yes | Partial | Yes | No | No | No | No | No | Yes | No |
| DFI-17 | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | No | Yes | Partial | Yes | No | No | Yes | No | No | No | No |

## 4. What does the

 research tell us?
## Overview

There is inadequate disclosure of both aggregate and disaggregated financial information across the DFIs.

Increased FDI in developing economies is reliant on improved financial transparency and market information.

In the long term, alignment of definitions can improve the usability of data, but this should not act as a barrier to transparency in the present.

Appropriate levels of aggregation can help tackle cases of legitimate commercial confidentiality.

## Opportunities for Increased Transparency

Disclosure of concessionality - IFC's blended finance practices show the way.

Interviewees suggested that mobilisation information could represent an important next step in disaggregated disclosure following concessionality.

Improving understanding of risk - opening up GEMs Risk Database.

## 5. Next steps



Publish WhatYouFund
The Global Campaign for Aid Transparency

## Next steps

We are concluding this work stream and open to feedback.

We are currently undertaking research on work stream 5: Financial Intermediaries, Offshore Financial Centres \& Beneficial Ownership.

Our transparency recommendations will be launched in September/October 2021.


Publish WhatYouFund
The Global Campaign for Aid Transparency
\#DFITransparency

